

Public Services

This chapter of the EIR evaluates the potential impacts of the Master Plan Update (the Project) related to the provision of public services, including police protection, fire protection and emergency services, and recreation services. The chapter describes the existing public services within and near the Project Area, and evaluates the potential for impacts on the demand for services that could result from the Project. Buildout of the Master Plan Update would not develop any new residential uses within the Project Area, and therefore would not create any direct demand for or result in any direct impacts to libraries, schools, or other public services. Although the Project may result in limited indirect effects (e.g., a limited number of inter-district school transfers and/or occasional use of a library by future employees), these indirect effects are not considered significant and libraries, schools and related community services are not further discussed, as no analysis is required.

Some of the information presented in this chapter draws from the prior analyses conducted for the 2007 MEIR and the 2012 SMEIR. Updated or additional information regarding environmental and Project-related public services was taken from the following sources:

- 2017 Municipal Services Assessment, prepared for 2017 Oyster Point Specific Plan Update, November 2017 (**Appendix 16**)¹
- *General Plan* of the City of South San Francisco
- *East of 101 Area Plan* of the City of South San Francisco
- *Subsequent EIR for the Community Civic Campus Project*, December 2017
- BCDC Permit #s 18-74(A) and 18-74(B) as amended through December 2009, and Permit #MO5-9 as of 2006

Environmental Setting

Police Services

Police services within the Project Area are provided by the South San Francisco Police Department (SSFPD). SSFPD is divided into two Divisions: Operations and Services. The Operations Division includes Patrol, Criminal Investigations, Downtown Bike Patrol, K-9, Neighborhood Response Team, SWAT/Hostage Negotiations and Traffic/Motors. The Services Division includes Communications, Community Relations, Property/Evidence, Records, Planning and Recruiting. Each Division is commanded by a Captain.

The SSFPD operates out of one main station, located at 33 Arroyo Drive. A new police headquarters that will replace the current SSFPD station is proposed as part of the City's Community Civic Campus project. In July

¹ Although this Municipal Services Assessment (MSA) was prepared for a separate project, and that project's EIR was not certified and the project was not approved, the MSA includes current citywide services information that is relevant to this analysis

2018, City Council selected a Master Plan that will serve as the basis for schematic design, and the complete design process is expected to be complete by the summer/fall of 2019. Construction is estimated in years 2020 to 2022. The Community Civic Campus is to be located at the northeast corner of El Camino Real and Chestnut, and will include a Police Station, a Fire Station (as part of Phase II), and a combined Library and Parks & Recreation Community Center, with parking and landscaping improvements.²

Implementing Policy 8.5.I-1 of the General Plan Health and Safety Element seeks to maintain a target ratio of 1.5 officers per 1,000 residents to ensure rapid and timely response to all emergencies. As of fiscal year 2016-17, the officer-to-population ratio for the SSFPD was approximately 1.03 officers per 1,000 population. In 2016, the SSFPD response times to Priority 1 (emergency) calls averaged 3:59 minutes, and to non-emergency calls averaged 6:03 minutes. These response times are considered acceptable (there is no standard against which they are measured, nor is there any obligated standard to measure against).³

Fire Protection and Emergency Services

Fire prevention, Municipal Code enforcement, fire suppression, emergency medical services (advanced life support and nonemergency basic life support and ambulance transportation), urban search and rescue, hazardous materials services, public education, disaster preparedness, and marine search and rescue services are provided by the South San Francisco Fire Department (SSFFD).

The SSFFD has five fire stations located throughout South San Francisco. Station #62 is the closest station to the Project Area, located within a mile away at 249 Harbor Way. Station #62 provides all first response services to the East of US 101 area, and provides first response to any emergency in the Project Area.

The SSF General Plan Health and Safety Element does not identify a personnel-to-service population target ratio. The SSFFD staffing consists of emergency response, fire prevention and administrative personnel, with 87 total full-time equivalent and approximately 6 hourly and contract employees. There are a minimum of 20 on-duty emergency response personnel staffing each of three shifts.

Response time is defined as the time that elapses between the moment a call is received by dispatch and the moment when the first unit assigned to the call arrives at the scene. The goal is to arrive at emergency incidents within seven minutes after a 911 call is received, including a 4-minute travel time. Response time goals are generally met system-wide, but the 2017 Municipal Assessment notes that SSFFD is actively looking for an additional or alternative site for Station #62 in the East of 101 area because this station's location in the southwesterly portion of East of 101 makes it difficult to meet response goals in the northern and eastern parts of the East of 101 Area.⁴

Water Supply for Fire Fighting

Delivery of water to Genentech buildings for use in fire protection relies on the on-Campus domestic water distribution system. Additionally, several buildings within the Genentech Campus have additional water storage tanks and/or fire pumps installed for local pressure control.

Genentech First Alert

Genentech's private First Alert Team provides fire response services for emergencies, including medical, chemical and fire emergencies within the Genentech Campus. Emergency call phones are located throughout

² <http://www.measurewsscivic.com/>

³ 2017 Oyster Point Specific Plan Update, Municipal Services Assessment (MSA)- Draft Existing Conditions and Needs assessment Report, prepared for City of South San Francisco by Michael Baker International, November 2017, page 8

⁴ 2017 Oyster Point Specific Plan Update MSA, page 7

the Genentech Campus and calls are routed to the Control Room Operator, who notifies the First Alert Team. If needed, the Control Room Operator also notifies outside emergency personnel such as the SSFPD.

Recreation

The South San Francisco Parks and Recreation Department manages parks and recreation centers within the city boundaries. According to the Municipal Services Assessment, there is an estimated 251 acres of parks and open space in the city. Community parks, neighborhood parks, mini-parks, specialty parks and linear parks collectively provide approximately 1.9 acres of developed parkland per 1,000 residents. Combined with open space and common green areas, there are approximately 3.9 acres of parks and open space per 1,000 residents. This ratio of parks and open space per 1,000 residents is greater than the General Plan standard of 3.0 acres per 1,000 residents. If jointly used school sites are included in the total park and open space calculations, the total parks and open space ratio increases to 5.4 acres per 1,000 residents.⁵

The nearest existing parks to the Project Area are the Jack Drago mini-park (located over a mile from the Project site) and the nearby Oyster Point Marina Park, which includes an open space/special use facility with walking trails, benches, picnic areas and marina-related services. All other park facilities are located west of US 101.

The Bay Trail connects the Genentech Campus to the broader San Francisco Bay regional park system. The Bay Trail is located within the generally 100-foot wide shoreline band around much of the San Francisco Bay, and is with the jurisdiction of the Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC). Within the Campus, the Bay Trail traverses the entire Campus shoreline, providing panoramic views of the Bay and short-range views of natural vegetation.

Regulatory Setting

Federal

There are no federal regulations related to public services applicable to the proposed Project.

State

The California Fire Code contains regulations relating to construction and maintenance of buildings and the use of premises. Topics addressed in the Code include fire department access, fire hydrants, automatic sprinkler systems, fire alarm systems, fire and explosion hazards safety, hazardous materials storage and use, provisions intended to protect and assist fire responders, industrial processes, and other general and specialized fire safety requirements for new and existing buildings and premises. The Code also contains specialized technical regulations related to fire and life safety.

Local

The City's General Plan contains implementing policies regarding public services. Applicable policies include the following:

Police

The Health and Safety Element of the General Plan includes the following applicable Implementing Policy:

- **Policy 8.5-I-1:** Ensure adequate police staff to provide rapid and timely response to all emergencies and maintain the capability to have minimum average response times.

⁵ 2017 Oyster Point Specific Plan Update MSA, page 11

- Actions that could be taken to ensure rapid and timely response to all emergencies include maintaining a law enforcement standard of 1.5 police officers per 1,000 residents;

Fire and Emergency Services

The Health and Safety Element of the General Plan includes the following applicable Guiding Policies:

- **Policy 8.4-G-1:** Minimize the risk to life and property from fire hazards in South San Francisco
- **Policy 8.4-G-2:** Provide fire protection that is responsive to citizens' needs.

The Health and Safety Element of the General Plan includes the following applicable Implementing Policies:

- **Policy 8.4-I-2:** Explore incentives or programs as part of the comprehensive fire hazard management program to encourage private landowners to reduce fire hazards on their property.
- **Policy 8.4-I-4:** Require site design features, fire retardant building materials, and adequate access as conditions for approval of development or improvements to reduce the risk of fire within the City.

City of South San Francisco Municipal Code

The City has adopted the California Fire Code as Chapter 15.24 of its Municipal Code.

City of South San Francisco East of 101 Area Plan

The East of 101 Area Plan includes the following:

- **Plan Goal 3.3:** Regulate growth in the East of 101 Area in accordance with the ability of the Police Department, Fire Department and other public agencies to provide adequate services.
- **Policy PF-1:** The City shall allow development in the East of 101 Area only if adequate water supply to meet its needs can be provided in a timely manner.

Impacts and Mitigation Measures

Analytic Method

The analysis in this section focuses on whether the Project would necessitate construction of new facilities in order to provide public services at acceptable service standards, and whether construction of any such new public service facilities would result in potentially adverse environmental effects.

Thresholds of Significance

Based on the CEQA Guidelines, the Project would have a significant environmental impact if it were to cause:

1. Substantial adverse physical impacts associated with the provision of new or physically altered governmental facilities, need for new or physically altered governmental facilities, the construction of which could cause significant environmental impacts, in order to maintain acceptable service ratios, response times or other performance objectives for any of the public services:
 - fire and emergency services
 - police services
 - parks and other recreational facilities
2. Increased use of existing neighborhood and regional parks or other recreational facilities such that substantial physical deterioration of the facility would occur or be accelerated; or

3. Substantial adverse physical impacts associated with the provision of new or physically altered recreation facilities, or the need for new or physically altered recreation facilities, the construction of which could cause significant environmental impacts, in order to maintain acceptable service ratios.

Buildout of the Project would not result in development of any new residential use, and would thus not create an increased demand for, or result in any impacts to libraries or schools. No impacts to library or school facilities would occur, and no additional analysis is required of these public services.

Police Services

Public Services 1: The Project would increase the number of employees in the Project Area over time, gradually increasing the demand for police within the Project Area. However, the Project is and will continue to be adequately served with police service from existing facilities or new facilities to be constructed per citywide efforts, and impacts related to police services would be less than significant. **(Less than Significant)**

The 2017 Municipal Services Assessment (or 2017 MSA) for South San Francisco provides incident rates, which can be used to estimate the number of incremental Police Department response calls that would result from buildout of the Project. The Project will result in an additional 4.3 million square feet of office/R&D building space at full buildout. Based on the MSA's identified incident rate of .0221 average annual calls per 1,000 square feet of office/R&D uses,⁶ buildout of the Project could potentially result in approximately 95 more police response calls per year, or approximately 1 additional call every 4 days.

Under CEQA, an increased demand for public services is not a physical environmental impact. Rather, environmental impacts are those physical effects that may be associated with construction of new facilities needed to provide adequate services.⁷ At a limited service demand of approximately 1 additional call every 4 days, the Project does not individually generate demand for a new police station. The Project would have a less than significant individual impact related to police services because no new police facilities (other than those already planned at the Community Civic Campus Project, see below) would be required.

Cumulative Effects

As noted in the Setting section above, the SSFPD operates from their main station (currently located at 33 Arroyo Drive), and a replacement police station is expected as part of the City's Community Civic Campus project, with construction planned for 2020 to 2022. The SSF Community Civic Campus Project was reviewed under its own EIR, which was certified by the City Council on December 13, 2017.⁸ The new Community Civic Campus project is intended to improve broader citywide (or cumulative) public services to the City. No physical effects associated with construction of new police facilities needed to serve cumulative service demands would occur beyond those already considered pursuant to the Community Civic Campus Project EIR.

Regulatory Requirements

Regulatory Requirement Services 1: Public Safety Impact Fees: Genentech will be required to pay the City of South San Francisco's Public Safety Impact Fees as applicable at the time of new construction.

⁶ Oyster Point Specific Plan Update MSA, Table A-2, Appendix A.

⁷ This interpretation of CEQA was reaffirmed specifically as it relates to fire stations in the case: *City of Hayward v. Board of Trustees of the California State University* (1st Dist., Div. 3 2015) 242 Cal.App.4th 833.

⁸ Subsequent Environmental Impact Report for the City of South San Francisco Community Civic Campus Project (SCH# 1996032052), certified by SSF City Council December 13, 2017

Mitigation Measures

No mitigation measures for the Project are necessary. Required contributions to the City's Public Safety Impact Fees represent the Project's fair share of costs to provide citywide police services resulting from cumulative development.⁹

Fire and Emergency Medical Services

Public Services 2: The Project would increase the number of employees in the Project Area over time, gradually increasing the demand for fire and emergency medical services within the Project Area. However, the Project is and will continue to be adequately served with fire and emergency medical service from existing facilities or new facilities to be constructed per citywide efforts, and impacts related to fire and emergency medical services would be less than significant. (**Less than Significant**)

The 2017 MSA provides incident rates that can be used to estimate the number of incremental fire and emergency response calls that would result from buildout of the Project. Based on an additional 4.3 million sf of building space at full buildout of the Project and the MSA incident rate of .0338 average annual calls per 1,000 sf of Office/R&D,¹⁰ full buildout of the Project would result in approximately 145 more firefighter/emergency response calls per year, or approximately one call every two or three days. This limited service demand would not individually generate the need for a new fire station to serve the Project. Additionally, Genentech's private First Alert Team provides supplemental fire response services for emergencies (including medical, chemical and fire emergencies) within the Genentech Campus. Emergency call phones are located throughout the Genentech Campus and calls are routed to the Control Room Operator, who notifies the First Alert Team. If needed, the Control Room Operator also notifies outside emergency personnel such as the SSFFD.

Cumulative Effects

Fire Station #62 serves the entire East of 101 Area from its location at 249 Harbor Boulevard. The 2017 Oyster Point MSA indicates that areas at the northerly and easterly portions of the East of 101 Area, including the easterly portions of the Project Area, are outside of a four-minute travel time from Fire Station #62. Cumulative development in the East of 101 Area (including the Project) is expected to necessitate relocation of Fire Station #62 to provide better response times to the entire East of 101 Area. A relocated Fire Station #62 could provide SSFFD with the ability to modify existing deployment to better support response time performance, which may be affected by traffic congestion or incident complexity. A relocated Fire Station would likely be similar in size as compared to the existing approximately 7,600 square foot Station #62, but would likely need to be configured to accommodate three apparatus bays and the ability to support an on-duty crew of seven personnel to meet modern operational and housing needs. Such a configuration would provide the opportunity to reconfigure existing fire company or ambulance deployment, which may include relocated or new personnel. Although there are no finalized plans for construction of a new fire station at this time, preliminary City planning efforts indicate that a new fire station site would need to be approximately ½ acre in size and more centrally located in the East of 101 Area than the current Station #62 site. It is reasonable to conclude that construction of such a new fire station would occur on a relatively small industrial infill site and would not be expected to result in individually significant environmental effects.

⁹ Pursuant to *Anderson First Coalition v. City of Anderson* (2005) [130 Cal.App.4th 1173], the appellate court held that paying a "fair-share fee" is permissible as effective mitigation if the fees are "part of a reasonable plan of actual mitigation that the relevant agency commits itself to implementing."

¹⁰ Oyster Point Specific Plan Update MSA, Michael Baker International, December 2017

Regulatory Requirements

Regulatory Requirement Services 2A - Compliance with Fire Code: Individual projects pursuant to the Master Plan Update will be required to comply with the City's Fire Code (Chapter 15.24 of the Municipal Code), and the City Fire Marshall's code requirements regarding on-site access for emergency vehicles.

Regulatory Requirement Services 1 - Public Safety Impact Fees: Genentech will be required to pay the City of South San Francisco's Public Safety Impact Fees as applicable at the time of new construction.

Mitigation Measures

No Project-specific mitigation measures needed beyond payment of Public Safety Impact Fees. For cumulative environmental effects, it is unlikely that construction of a new fire station to be located on a small industrial infill site in the central portion of the East of 101 Area would result in any significant environmental effects requiring mitigation.

Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15131, the economic effects of a project shall not be treated as significant effects on the environment. However, *"economic or social information may be included in an EIR or may be presented in whatever form the lead agency desires."* In this case, the need for a new or relocated fire station to improve fire protection service and provide better response times to serve cumulative development throughout the entire East of 101 Area is unlikely to result in either direct or indirect environmental effects. The limiting factors involved in developing a new or relocated fire station are primarily economic, only.

Under the current development impact fee structure, the City of South San Francisco's Public Safety Impact Fees, which are payable at the time of new building permits, do not provide present-day funds in a timely manner to offset the near-term costs of a new fire station. Furthermore, the aggregate of Public Safety Impact Fees expected to be paid over time by new cumulative development, including the Project, are not likely sufficient to fund property acquisition and construction costs associated with a new or relocated fire station. As noted in the 2017 Oyster Point Municipal Services Assessment, "it is anticipated that the station [relocated Station #62] will be funded via a special tax district,¹¹ but no such special tax district is currently established. To provide needed funds for a new and/or relocated fire station, it is anticipated that the City will need to establish a Community Facilities District (CFD) pursuant to the Mello-Roos Community Facilities Act of 1982, providing for a special property tax to be levied on those properties in the East of 101 Area benefitting from a new or relocated fire station. These special taxes can be used to secure bonds issued for purposes of financing near-term construction of the fire station. Any special taxes levied through a CFD must be approved by two-thirds of the voters within such a district (i.e., two-thirds of the benefitting property owners within the East of 101 Area). An updated and increased Public Safety Impact Fee applicable to the East of 101 Area (or potential in-lieu contributions associated with property dedication) could also offset costs associated with construction and on-going fire protection and emergency response services needed to serve new cumulative development.

Recreation

Public Services 3: The Project would increase the number of employees in the Project Area over time, gradually increasing the demand for recreational space within or near the Project Area. However, the existing Campus contains substantial public and private open space areas, and the Project includes plans for increasing open spaces with plazas, pathways, and common open space to serve new

¹¹ Oyster Point Specific Plan Update MSA, Michael Baker International, December 2017, page 57

employees. Impacts related to recreational open space would be less than significant. (**Less than Significant**)

The Master Plan Update's Urban Design chapter includes a specific focus on open space and walkability, intended to strengthen the campus environment within the Project Area. These design elements include establishing an important outdoor area at the Upper Campus as an identifiable Campus center that connects the new Employee Center to other locations in the Project Area with pedestrian paths, interconnecting smaller open spaces within each neighborhood campus with a system of secondary pedestrian paths; and adding new outdoor spaces that complement each new building. The proposed pedestrian network is intended to provide a more integrated and walkable campus, and coordination of pedestrian connections with shuttle-bus stop locations will enhance neighborhood and Campus connectivity. The design of new pathways is intended to increase the coherence of the Campus with common elements such as trees, paving, seating and overlooks, and to offer choices for walking between and among neighborhood campuses. The pedestrian system also includes walkways that are recreational in nature, connecting to the Bay Trail and Wind Harp via pathways along hillsides and bluffs. This recreational element of the pedestrian network offers an additional realm of experience, accenting the natural setting and environment of the Campus.

Cumulative

Genentech and the Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC) have entered into several permits that support on-going use of the Bay Trail by the public, on property within the Genentech Campus but subject to BCDC jurisdiction. Generally, these permits authorize Genentech to construct, use and maintain a public access trail (the Bay Trail) within the 100-foot band of BCDC jurisdiction along the Bay shoreline, inclusive of connecting trails, handicapped access, landscaping, site furnishings (including benches, garbage cans, picnic areas and BBQ grills), as well as public access parking spaces and public access signs.¹² These Bay Trail amenities provide benefits to Genentech employees, but also to the general public seeking open space and nature-based recreation.

Any changes or additions to the Bay Trail improvements within the Genentech Campus will be subject to BCDC consideration and approval of amended permit conditions. Through on-site provision of recreational opportunities, payment of in-lieu fees to support off-site recreational opportunities as required by SSF Municipal Code, and required BCDC jurisdictional permit approval processes, the Project will not result in significant environmental impacts related to parks or recreation facilities.

Regulatory Requirements

Regulatory Requirement Services 3 - Parkland Acquisition and Construction Fees: Genentech will be required to pay Parkland Acquisition and Construction fees pursuant to Chapter 8.67 of the SSF Municipal Code.

These fees are based on the average fair market value of land and average construction costs for improved parkland, at a ratio of one-half acre of parkland per one thousand new employees (using the current employment-based formula provided in SSFMC Section 8.67.060).

Mitigation Measures

No mitigation measures would be required beyond payment of Parkland Acquisition and Construction fees. The Parkland Acquisition and Construction fees are intended to offset the financial effects related to increased demand for parks and recreational facilities resulting from cumulative development.

¹² BCDC Permit #MOS-9, August 24, 2006, and BCDC Permit Nos. 18-74(A) and 18-74(B) originally issued in January 1975 and as amended through December 2009 and recorded on January 14, 2010

Cumulative Effects on Public Services

Cumulative effects related to public services are fully addressed under the topics of police, fire protection and parks and recreation in Impacts Public Services 1, 2 and 3, above.